

Europe and International Department

EVALUATION AND ACCREDITATION DOCUMENTS

M.Sc. Post-Harvest Engineering and Technology for Food Processing and Preservation

Centre for Food Technology and Research (CEFTER) Benue state University

Makurdi,

Nigeria

September 2019

Rapport publié le 21/11/2019



CONTENTS

EVALUATION REPORT	
COMMENTS OF THE INSTITUTION	
ACCREDITATION DECISION	14 – following



International evaluation and accreditation

EVALUATION REPORT

M.Sc. Post-Harvest Engineering and Technology for Food Processing and Preservation

Centre for Food Technology and Research (CEFTER) Benue state University Makurdi, Nigeria

JULY - 2019



The Benue State University has mandated the Hcéres to perform the evaluation of its Post-Harvest Engineering and Technology for Food Processing and Preservation master programme. The evaluation is based on the "External Evaluation Standards" of foreign study programmes, adopted by the Hcéres Board on October 4th, 2016. These standards are available on the Hcéres website (hceres.fr).

For the Hcéres¹:

Michel Cosnard, President

On behalf of the experts committee²:

Carole Molina Jouve, President of the committee

In accordance with the decree n°2014-1365, November 14th, 2014,

²The evaluation reports "sont signés par le président du comité". (Article 11, alinéa 2) — "are signed by the president of the committee" (article 11, alinea 2).

¹ The president of Hcéres "contresigne les rapports d'évaluation établis par les comités d'experts et signés par leur président." (Article 8, alinéa 5) — "countersigns the assessment reports made by the experts' committees and signed by their president" (article 8, alinea 5).



CONTENTS

I. Study PROGRAMME Identity Sheet	. 6
II. On-site visit description	. 7
Composition of the experts panel	7
On-site visit description	7
III. PRESENTATION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMME	, 7
1 – PRESENTATION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMME	7
2 - Presentation of the programme's self-evaluation approach	8
IV. EVALUATION REPORT	. 8
1- Aims OF THE STUDY programme -A	8
2 – POSITION OF THE STUDY PROGRAM -B	8
3 – STUDY PROGRAMME TEACHING STRUCTURE -B	9
4 – PROGRAM MANAGEMENT -B	9
V. conclusion 1	10
StrENGTHS	11
WeakNESSES	11
VI. COMMENTS OF THE INSTITUTION 1	12



I. STUDY PROGRAMME IDENTITY SHEET

University/institution: Benue State University (BSU), Makurdi, Nigeria

Component, faculty or department concerned: Centre for Food Technology and Research (CEFTER), Department of Vocational and Technical Education

Programme's title: Master in Post-Harvest Engineering and Technology

Training/speciality: none

Year of creation and context: 2015, to mitigate post-harvest loses and guarantee quality products and food security

Site(s) where the programme is taught (Town and campus): Makurdi, CEFTER

Programme director:

Surname, first name: Labe, Benedict lorzer

Profession and grade: Mechanical Production Technology, HOD Vocational and Technical Education, Associate Professor

Main subject taught: Mechanical Technology

METHODS AND RESULTS OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION(S)

Methodology and agency

The accreditation of post-graduate academic program of African centers of excellence (ACEs) in Nigerian universities made by National Universities Commission (NUC) in March 2017 does not cite this CEFTER master's program in Post-Harvest Engineering and Technology, but the PhD Post-Harvest Engineering and Technology for which resources were verified by NUC for accreditation. According to the CEFTER officials, this is a mistake, because the center does not offer the PhD in this course, but the Master. Center officials notify recently the NUC for correction.

Results: Unknown.

HUMAN AND MATERIAL RESOURCES DEDICATED TO THE PROGRAMME

Human resources

The staff is composed of 5 Professors, 3 Associate Professors, 3 Senior Lecturers and 7 in the Lecture I category.

Material resources

The MSc Post-Harvest Engineering and Technology benefits from CEFTER facilities has lecture rooms, internet access, scientific library, full equipped labs, and access to farms facilities in the agricultural university (20 minutes far).

STUDENT POPULATION: EVOLUTION AND TYPOLOGY OVER THE LAST 4 YEARS

YEAR	MALE	FEMALE	NATIONAL	FOREIGN	TOTAL
2015/2016	9	1	10	NIL	10
2016/2017	4	NIL	4	NIL	4
2017/2018	6	1	6	1	7
2018/2019	2	NIL	2	NIL	2
TOTAL	21	2	22	1	23



II. ON-SITE VISIT DESCRIPTION

COMPOSITION OF THE EXPERTS PANEL

President:

- Carole Molina Jouve, Professor, Institut National des Sciences appliquées de Toulouse

Experts:

- Christophe Bressac, Assistant Professor, Université de Tours
- Delphine Latour, Assistant Professor, Université de Clermont-Auvergne
- Mathilde Colas, PhD Student (Student Expert), Université de Technologie de Troyes

Hcéres was represented by Pierre Courtellemont, Science Advisor.

ON-SITE VISIT DESCRIPTION

- Date of the visit: July the 3rd, 2019
- Organisation of the visit: the visit was made the 3rd of July, on the NUC site, during one day with on-site meetings with the management team, academic staff, and closed meetings by videoconferencing with partners, alumni and students.
- Cooperation of study programme and institution to be accredited: perfect cooperation by all stakeholders
- People met (NUC site): Daniel Kparevfa Adedzwa, Former Centre Leader Barnabas Achakpa Ikyo, Deputy Director/Project Manager (New Centre Leader) Sylvester Obaike Adejo, Deputy Director (R&D) Scholarstica Banka, Centre Secretary Toryina Ayati Varvar, Dean of Postgraduate School, Professor Benedict lorzer Labe, HOD Vocational and Technical Education, Associate Professor Ogbene Gillian Igbum, HOD Chimistry, Associate Professor Solomon Ogebe Aligba, Deputy Director of Academic Planning Daniel Momngu Tiough, Associate Professor Benjamin Asen Anhwange, Senior Lecturer P.I. Utange, Principal Technolgist Victor Tarnongo, Translator Daniel Elaigwu Enenche, PhD Food chemistry Student James Flomo Gaydaybu, MSc Post Harvest Student Tyokula Mbaihangeve, MSc Food chemistry Student

III. PRESENTATION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMME

1 – PRESENTATION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMME

The Master program Post-Harvest Engineering and Technology for Food Processing and Preservation, from the Benue State University of Makurdi, Nigeria (BSU) is a high-level education program made to educate young and professional students to the knowledge and mastering of techniques and technologies needed to transform and preserve crops products. The master is included in the Center for Food Technology and Research (CEFTER) which is itself a center of excellence recognized and supported by the world bank. The master program is at the interface of agriculture and technologies. Applicants may come from the whole region, and courses are in English. Students benefit from facilities which include real machines used in crop products processing and meet professionals during visits and internships. They are mixed with students from other masters for practical project facing them with real situations. Master is a full time course built for two years, first one with courses, seminars, practice project and internships, and the second for the research dissertation.



2 - PRESENTATION OF THE PROGRAMME'S SELF-EVALUATION APPROACH

No information was given about a self-evaluation committee. Self-evaluation report was transmitted to the Hcéres committee with supporting documents related to students and the center in general.

IV. EVALUATION REPORT

1- AIMS OF THE STUDY PROGRAMME

The objectives of the program are clearly explained and focused on the mastering of technologies for crops products preservation and transformation, from 'farm to fork', including storage, transport and packaging. Aims of the training program are clear and in close connection with local and regional concerns. Through mixing scientific and technical approaches, the master focuses to fundamental and practical skills of high levels.

This program aims to specialize undergraduate students to the specificities of agriculture products process and processing. It includes many aspects of engineering and industrial technologies at their both fundamental and applied dimensions for the preservation of agricultural products. Are also present business, entrepreneurship and research methods. It results in a multidisciplinary approach of applied technologies. Because of its global approach, the Post-Harvest Engineering and Technology master has no equivalent at both national and regional scales. Some other graduate programs exist but are specialized in other industrial activity sectors as transport, energy, etc.

The outcomes in terms of skills are well identified and several professions/jobs are suggested to graduates of this program. These globally deal with process design, innovation in processes, energy optimization, etc. In these areas, graduates can be employed by either private, government or non-governmental organization as well as being self-employed.

In terms of further study programs, it is clearly aimed that graduates can be qualified for a PhD to pursue their research carrier in University, but it could not be verified because only one student from Liberia was met by the committee.

2 – POSITION OF THE STUDY PROGRAM

Both scientific and technical environments of the MScs program are good. Partners are numerous, however they could increase their pedagogic participation for students.

This training is unique in the catchment area of Benue State University. For that reason, the program aims to recruit students from several countries within the West and Central Africa sub-region.

Stakeholders where involved from the beginning of the master program to construct curricula and field experiences as internships. Partners have the need to collaborate with the master program. A list of partners is included in the report and some of them were met during the visit.

The research themes developed by the CEFTER match with the scoop of the training and are oriented in an interdisciplinary way focusing on food chemistry and technology. The relationship between the CEFTER and the business' partners is established. While partners host students for internships and visits, they do not teach formally inside the walls of the university. Teachers of the university are accompanied by the University of Copenhagen which introduces them with pedagogic methods.

Concerning the research area, the CEFTER has contracted agreements with several partnerships located in foreign countries, as for example United Kingdom, Cameroun, Ghana, and also at a national scale with Nigerian universities and institutes. With this large range of partnerships, it should be expected a better involvement in courses and student exchanges that will increase the awareness of the master program.

Mechanisms are implemented to encourage exchange of lecturers in short visits, to facilitate the mobility of students, through exchange and visits and to promote invitations of scholars in conferences and symposia. The report does not precise the way such motilities are organized.



The international mobility is not particularly encouraged but the fact that students are all English speakers is a real advantage to develop foreign partnerships. Regional students can do their research in their country, with a local supervisor and a CEFTER teacher. Here, again, examples were not indicated.

3 - STUDY PROGRAMME TEACHING STRUCTURE

The teaching units are consistent with the objectives and exposed in detail in the self-evaluation report. Courses include both scientific and technical learning, with a great part as practical. The first year is heavy because it includes courses, practices, visits, 3 periods of 3 weeks each of internship with partners and a food innovation project. Second year is devoted to research dissertation. Students benefit from good conditions to acquire their professional skills.

Teaching program includes regular courses, visits and internships. For nonnative English students, a translation is available. This is apparently useless for the Post-Harvest Engineering and Technology master because all but one student are from Nigeria. The unique foreign student is from Liberia where English is the national language. All courses occur during the first two semesters and must be validated for the master graduation. The last two semesters are dedicated to the research internship. The program includes prescribed modules that must be followed and passed, and elective modules. Such specific courses are chosen by students under the advices of teachers. It is unclear if students are mixed with others during certain classes or not. All rules are presented in the student booklet. Some courses are only followed by 1 or 2 students. Teachers are satisfied by such low numbers¹. This allows a specialization of the program during the second semester adapted to each student.

The first year includes an internship of three periods of 3 weeks in different places; no example was given to the committee.

A year project is realized by groups of students from different master programs. It is a true experience of learning by doing which is accompanied by teachers and partners and may lead to real food product. Results are presented during the food week, where students meet partners to promote their innovative products. All along the courses, field experience is favored, for instance packaging course conduct students to follow products from the farms where there are produced to the market where they are sold.

Teachers were trained on the use of innovative teaching tools and start to use smart classrooms and e-content for students. In addition, students receive a laptop that allow them to connect to online libraries. It gives really good work conditions for students and their teachers. A special effort is also made to use new communication tools to promote the visibility of this training and its internal communication. For example, the CEFTER has a functional website linked to social network, a newsletters, internet access for all students and staff. The virtual visit of facilities through a video confirmed that this equipment was actually present and used for teaching.

A total of 38 credits are obtained by module exams, 10 by the dissertation proposal and only 2 by the professional internship, for the whole master. Validation of the research dissertation is not clear because credits are allowed to the first year.

After courses evaluations, students have to choose their research topic and apply for their research program with necessary field or lab experiments. This preliminary application is evaluated by teachers who agree or not with the project. Some students do entrepreneurship during this period, their number was not communicated.

4 – PROGRAM MANAGEMENT

With 17 permanent teachers, the staff is sufficient to manage the program. Courses contain and organization are well detailed in the student handbook. Program is improved by teachers, partners (involved in internship, research/project supervision and some courses) and students. The student number is monitored each year, distinguishing genders and national from foreign students. The number of students is low and applications are insufficient for women and regional students. Promotion of the master is insufficient to attract more students. Duration of the program exceeds 3 years for most students.

The CEFTER program domiciled in the Department of Vocational and Technical Education has sufficient staff to manage the program. The staff is composed of 17 permanents teachers² and is managed by the head of department.

¹Meeting with teachers during the visit

² Self-evaluation report



The students are aware of the list of teachers which is enclosed in the student handbook. They can find details concerning the rank, qualifications and teaching specialization of each of them¹. Private partners are involved in both internship and research/project supervision, and they perform two courses for all students in the Post-Harvest Engineering and Technology program.

The rules of course assessment are clearly exposed in the student's handbook. Courses are assessed by written examinations while research seminars/project/dissertations are assessed by a report and an oral examination. The process to be eligible for examination, methods for testing knowledge and rules of courses validation are explicitly stated and known to students¹. Each module gives 2 or 3 credits (except dissertation with 10). The table of credits in the handbook students didn't evidence prescribed and elective modules. Moreover, a booklet describes in details the rules of thesis defense.

To better match with the working world, CEFTER invites institutional and private partners to the presentation of innovative products by students. It had positive consequences on curricula of education programs.

Teaching and practical professional units are clearly expressed as skills in the student's handbook¹. Nevertheless, the program does not have a formal skills portfolio to help students record skills acquired.

The student number is monitored each year, distinguishing genders and national from foreign students. The number of students is seemingly low, from 4 to 10 (the first year) students per year, including only one regional income, and 2 women for total of 26 students in 4 years. It is obvious that the proportion of origins and genders are not in accordance with the international high-level ambition of the program. It is its main weakness. During the visit, this point was discussed with parts, and it appears that the program does not suffer from concurrency but could be perceived as too specialized and selective for applicants. Rules for selection are common for all master programs in Nigeria, imposing high quotations and equivalences for regional students. Teachers are confident in the promotion of the program by graduate students who are becoming ambassadors in their countries. It has been proposed to expand to sciences of energy to increase the number of applicants in the future. However, such strategy will not increase the number of women because background is mainly technology and applied physics and those undergraduate studies do not attract young women.

Admission requirements are transparent and clearly exposed on the website of the CEFTER, so students can enroll easily using prescribed forms approved by the board of the school of postgraduate studies.

Students can have grants for their studies, foreign students could have a full scholarship, but national students may only apply for either a grant for tuition or for accommodation as specified by governmental rules.

There is no specific graduate tracking system, but the staff uses email and social media tools to reach out to graduates. (A file was added to the report for past students information). There is a strong desire to create an alumni network by teachers in charge of the CEFTER master programs. During the visit, no alumni were met ².

The program is built to be performed in two or three years, depending of the needs of the research. In reality, only two students for the first year are yet graduated, most of the students beginning in September 2015 being not graduated after 4 years. For those students, research dissertation could be as long as a true PhD in other countries - i.e. 3 years. This situation has to be solved by teachers and administrative staff.

The university has a code of ethics where anti-fraud, relationship with staff, conduct on the campus are recorded.

V. CONCLUSION

The Post-harvest Engineering and Technology master program is one of the high level courses given by the Benue State University of Makurdi in its Center for Food Technology and Research (CEFTER). This program has all the human and infrastructure requirements to educate postgraduate and professional students to be actors of the preservation, storage and transport of agricultural products for this region of Africa. The situation in Nigeria is on phase with the agricultural development of the country, who is a leader for food production in this part of the world.

The self-evaluation report is well made and contains all the information needed for the Hcéres committee. Some additional points were enlightened during the visit thanks to the cooperation of stakeholders.

¹ Student's handbook

² Visit of the comitee



Based on simultaneous formal courses and more technical learning times, this program offers a multidisciplinary education for scientists, advisors and entrepreneurs to manage and innovate.

This master program was improved by partners who participate to education through internships and innovation project. Courses are evaluated by students. The whole management of the master program is made to make it an excellent education program.

However, two main points should be improved, namely the number of students and the time needed to complete the program.

1. Number of students is not at its best, it should be increased to reach the goal of becoming a school of excellence in food technology. Foreign and women students should be the target for applications

2. The duration of the studies which exceeds what was planned in the student handbook may handicap students to apply for a job.

The common objectives of the CEFTER for post graduate programs evidence the need of a unique master course with progressive specializations. It would greatly improve the attractiveness of the programs.

STRENGTHS

- Unique training programme in Nigeria focusing on engineering and industrial technologies for the preservation of agricultural products with a global approach
- Scientific and technical education program focused on urgent needs of the region
- Very well structured and managed training programme, with an adequate number of qualified staff
- Academic staff, facilities and partnerships of high levels
- Multi-disciplinary approach to program delivery
- Accommodation for students.

WEAKNESSES

- Two low number of students per year and insufficient women and regional students
- Duration of the studies exceeding 3 years before graduation
- No industrial partners involve in the teaching
- Training does not promote enough international student mobility.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- Join the master program with other MScs in order to build a program including common course during the first semester and specializations thereafter
- Promote the program and encourage teachers to recruit more students
- Monitor progresses during the research to fix temporal objectives of acquired skills
- Have more lessons given by partners to increase professional skills
- Set up a skills portfolio so that students can record skills acquired during the training
- Create an alumni network with teachers in charge of the CEFTER master programs
- Encourage incoming and outgoing international mobility of students.

VI. COMMENTS OF THE INSTITUTION

BENUE STATE UNIVERSITY MAKURDI NIGERIA

CENTER FOR FOOD TECHNOLOGY AND RESEARCH

VICE-CHANCELLOR

PROF. Moses Msugh Kembe B.Sc. (Jos), M.Sc (UNN)& Ph.D (UAM), PGDM (UMM)

DIRECTOR

Dr. Barnabas Achakpa Ikyo BSc. (BSU)M.Sc(UAM) Ph.D &Post Doc (Surrey)



PMB 102119 Makurdi, Nigeria <u>www.bsum.edu.ng</u> <u>aikyo@bsum.edu.ng</u> Phone: +234(0)8185069529

23rd August, 2019

Prof. François PERNOT Directeur/Director Département Europe et International Europe and International Department

Sir,

COMMENTS ON MSC POSTHARVEST ENGINEERING AND TECHNOLOGY EVALUATION REPORT

We have received and reviewed your draft evaluation report in respect of our application for International accreditation in MSc. Postharvest Engineering Technology. This is one of the programs that were set up to support the implementation of the World Bank funded Africa Centres of Excellence for which our centre CEFTER Benue State University is part of. Our focus is on control of postharvest food losses.

Our interaction with the HCERES has been quite useful; we used your self-evaluation documents/guidelines to carry out the self-evaluation of the MSc program and other programs in the department.

During the onsite meeting, your team lead by **Prof. Carole Molina Jouve**, made very valid contributions that have provided more insight into developing a program that will rate very high in an international accreditation. Some of the lessons learnt will form our program review this next year.

Just like you rightly mentioned, the MSc. Postharvest Engineering Technology is a unique training programme in Nigeria which focusing is on engineering and industrial technologies for the preservation of agricultural products with a global approach to meet the urgent needs of the West and Central Africa region. We also did our best in the structure and management of the programme, with an adequate number of multi-disciplinary qualified Academic and technical staff. We are excited that your team noted this.

Your team observed rightly that we have low number of students per year and insufficient women and regional students. The centre took note of this and has allocated more funds to provide studentships to women and regional students in the upcoming academic sessions. This we believe will improve the student numbers and promote student international mobility.

Generally, your recommendations are valid and will be used to improve on the program. But more specifically, we will promote the program and encourage teachers to recruit more students, improve on progress monitoring during the research to ensure timely completion and to fix temporal objectives of acquired skills and have more lessons given by partners to increase professional skills. We will also set up a skills portfolio so that students can record skills acquired during the training and create an alumni network with teachers in charge of the CEFTER master programs.

Finally, we appreciate the detail and thorough nature of your accreditation process and believe that the outcome will be a fair rating of our current status and taking into account the huge prospects for improvement based on your valid points so that we will continue to implement a top quality MSc Post Harvest Engineering program that will serve its purpose of filling the skills gap in the sub region. This we believe will contribute to solving a regional developmental challenge of controlling postharvest food losses.

Kind regards,

Dr. Barnabas Achakpa Ikyo Director/Centre Leader



International evaluation and accreditation

ACCREDITATION DECISION

M.Sc. Post-Harvest Engineering and Technology for Food Processing and Preservation

Centre for Food Technology and Research (CEFTER), Benue state University, Makurdi, Nigeria

September 2019



SCOPE OF THE ACCREDITATION GRANTED BY HCÉRES

Hcéres has built its evaluation process based on a set of objectives that higher education institution study programmes must pursue to ensure recognised quality within France and Europe. These objectives are divided up into four fields among which are the accreditation criteria.

As for the "External Evaluation Standards", the accreditation criteria have been specifically designed for foreign programmes. The accreditation criteria were adopted by the Board on June 2016 and are available on the Hcéres website (hceres.fr).

The accreditation committee, meeting his accreditation decision, has wholly taken into account the final evaluation report of the study programme. This accreditation decision is the result of a collegial and reasoned process.

The accreditation decision issued by Hcéres shall not grant any rights whatsoever, whether in France or abroad. The decision on training programme accreditation confers an accreditation label and does not infer recognition of the accredited qualifications. The Hcéres accreditation process therefore has no impact on the qualifications recognition process in France.



FULFILLMENT OF ACCREDITATION CRITERIA

FIELD 1: AIMS OF THE STUDY PROGRAMME

Accreditation criterion

The objectives of the study programme with regard to knowledge and skills to be acquired are clearly defined and communicated. Students and other stakeholders are aware of outcomes in terms of job opportunities and further studies.

Criterion assessment

The objectives of the program are clearly explained and focused on the mastering of technologies for crops products preservation and transformation, from 'farm to fork', including storage, transport and packaging. Aims of the training program are clear and in close connection with local and regional concerns. Through mixing scientific and technical approaches, the master focuses on fundamental and practical skills of high levels.

FIELD 2: POSITION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMME

Accreditation criterion

The study programme has set a comprehensive positioning suited to its objectives and including a clear link with research, scholarly partnerships and/or with the economic and social world, national and/or international partnerships.

Criterion assessment

Both scientific and technical environments of the MScs program are good. Partners are numerous, however they could increase their pedagogic participation for students.

FIELD 3: STUDY PROGRAMME TEACHING STRUCTURE

Accreditation criterion

The study programme includes a set of teaching units that are coherent, gradual and adapted to all kind of students. The study programme allows students to acquire additional skills that are useful for employment or further study.

Internships and projects are included in the study programme curriculum. So are Information and Communication Technologies in Education (ICTE) and education innovations. The study programme prepares students for the international environment.

Criterion assessment

The teaching units are consistent with the objectives and exposed in detail in the self-evaluation report. Courses include both scientific and technical learning, with a great part as practical. The first year is heavy because it includes courses, practices, visits, 3 periods of 3 weeks each of internship with partners and a food innovation project. Second year is devoted to research dissertation. Students benefit from good conditions to acquire their professional skills.

FIELD 4: STUDY PROGRAMME MANAGEMENT

Accreditation criterion

The study programme is implemented by a formally identified and operational teaching team including stakeholder and student participation. It is carried out by an educational team which benefits from clear and up-to-date data. Methods for checking knowledge are explicitly stated and communicated to students. Teaching and practical professional units are expressed in terms of skills. Anti-fraud measures have been implemented.



Criterion assessment

With 17 permanent teachers, the staff is sufficient to manage the program. Courses content and organization are well detailed in the student handbook. Program is improved by teachers, partners (involved in internship, research/project supervision and some courses) and students. The student number is monitored each year, distinguishing genders and national from foreign students. The number of students is low and applications are insufficient for women and regional students. Promotion of the master is insufficient to attract more students. Duration of the program exceeds 3 years for most students.



ACCREDITATION DECISION

Considering the accreditation criteria analysis detailed above, the accreditation commission takes the following decision:

"Five-year unreserved accreditation decision"

and draws attention to the various recommendations made by the committee of experts in its evaluation report:

- Join the master program with other MScs in order to build a program including common course during the first semester and specializations thereafter.
- Promote the program, encourage teachers to recruit more students, create an alumni network with teachers in charge of the CEFTER master programs.
- Have more lessons given by partners to increase professional skills.
- Encourage incoming and outgoing international mobility of students.

SIGNATURE

For HCERES and on behalf of

Michel Com

Michel COSNARD,

President

Date: Paris, September 4th, 2019

The evaluation reports of Hceres are available online : <u>www.hceres.com</u>

Evaluation of clusters of higher education and research institutions Evaluation of higher education and research institutions Evaluation of research Evaluation of doctoral schools Evaluation of programmes Evaluation abroad



2 rue Albert Einstein 75013 Paris, France T. 33 (0)1 55 55 60 10

